

Oxfam's Management Response to the External Mid-Term Evaluation Empower Youth for Work

Introduction

The Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) was carried out for the Oxfam Empower Youth for Work (EYW) project funded by the IKEA Foundation. During the evaluation, EYW was in its third year of implementation. The main aim of the MTE was to systematically analyze EYW's progress and achievements up to November 2018. The MTE shows that the project is progressing well. It is very exciting that it gives evidence of increased confidence and decision-making power among the youth. The MTE stresses the unique holistic character of the EYW Theory of Change, and validates its overall direction. The approach combining soft skills and technical skills trainings with the youth group work and the rolled out influencing strategies is thus to be continued. The MTE concludes that businesses were set up or upgraded and technical skills enhanced youth's position on the labor market. The MTE reports a sense of solidarity youth found when faced with traditional gender norms, creating space for young women to attend meetings to discuss matters not usually discussed at home. Such first hints of social change are very encouraging. The MTE has already had effects on the implementation as learnings have been incorporated in the activities and in the planning for the project's fourth year.

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation was threefold:

- a) Collect evidence about whether the project has been implemented as planned and the expected as well as unexpected outcomes achieved so far
- b) Assess the effectiveness, relevance, efficiency, sustainability, partnerships of our current strategies in each country, from the point of view of different stakeholders, in particular young women and men. For Ethiopia, a specific question on the Loan Guarantee Fund was included.
- c) Critically review emerging evidence related to the achievement of EYW's overall impact (project documents, mid-line survey results, ..) and collect further qualitative evidence to substantiate these findings. See annex 1 for more on the context and background of the MTE.

This management response to the external mid-term evaluation Empower Youth for Work was prepared with the advice of the MTE Reference Group, EYW Country Project team Leads and EYW Steering Committee.

It includes the following sections:

- 1)** The first section conveys the MTE main findings and EYW key follow-up actions.
- 2)** The second section provides a summary of the quality assessment of the MTE process and report.
- 3)** The third section summarizes Oxfam's response and actions per MTE recommendation.
- 4)** Section four provides Oxfam's factual corrections to mistakes in the MTE report
- 5)** Annex 1 provides the context and background of the MTE.

1. Summary of MTE main findings and EYW follow-up actions

The MTE concludes that the EYW programme is progressing well. Some output-related activities have already been completed and most are underway. External factors, which have influenced the project's implementation timeline and activities, were unforeseen as just bad luck. Other such factors, for example the state of security in Ethiopia, were bad timing.

The inception period, that took longer than planned, postponed plans for implementation, which had made it that the project is not as far along as originally planned. However, preliminary midline research outcomes available for Bangladesh and Ethiopia show promise and potential for reaching the project's goals in good order.

The project is unique, and many stakeholders appreciate its approach. The holistic ToC is commended and appreciated, and the mid-term evaluation and more specifically the TOC reflection does not bring any insights or recommendations for fundamental change of direction of the project TOC. The project aims to work with young people aged 15-29, which is not the easiest age category to work with and which show large differences between genders. In addition, the project works in rural areas that are affected by climate change and where the foundation for economic empowerment and in terms of linkage with the private sector is weak.

Such a courageous approach is worthy of praise and the evaluation team urges the EYW project staff to keep working in this line, to keep its ambition, to maintain the space for innovation and to keep the spirit of overcoming challenges, in favour of young people's rights, wellbeing and development and towards climate change resilience. Ambition and motivation are important ingredients to learning from the MTE and its outcomes and for planning for the remaining two years of the project.

MTE findings: Key achievements of the programme

The MTE states that a lot of achievements are reported in the quarterly and annual reports. Youth and project staff in other project areas often confirmed these achievements and are shown to be different from youth's experiences outside of project areas. In general, local governments, country offices, implementing partners and young people appreciated the project for its unique approach and focus on youth. Other positive contributions and achievements include:

- Contributions are made to strengthen young people's sense of agency. Through soft skills training and interactions, they now have more self-confidence and can raise issues pertaining to their own and other young people's lives and they are now better equipped to take these issues to higher decision-making levels of the community and beyond.
- In line with economic empowerment, businesses have been set up or upgraded and mentorships have been initiated.
- The project has also enabled young people to learn new technical skills to contribute to their employment opportunities. In addition, there is a sense of solidarity and support individual youth have found when faced with traditional gender norms: groups temporarily become the new peers. This has created space for young women to attend meetings also outside and further away from their homes to discuss matters not usually discussed at home. Such increase in freedoms set the tone and foundation for the project.
- Notwithstanding delays caused by policy changes related to the space for INGOs, political conflict and unrest, activities have been initiated, links with the governments have been established and existing businesses have been engaged to train and/or employ young people.
- The Loan Guarantee Fund is seen as a positive contribution in Ethiopia for access to credit for young people. In other project countries, links with banks or micro-finance institutions are being established between youth groups and individuals through introductions by implementing partners to facilitate access to credit.
- In addition, the Emotive exchanges and the Global Learning Events (GLE) have been positive opportunities to exchange learning, teachings, insights and ideas.

MTE findings: Challenges and needs for improvement:

Though the project has seen achievements, there are some aspects, which pose challenges to the project. Some challenges are shortcomings in project design and others are due to external and unforeseen factors. Regardless, challenges need not determine a negative outcome of the project but can be rectified. Challenges and areas for improvement include:

- Experienced power hierarchy between Oxfam Novib and Country Offices as well as between Country Offices and the Implementing Partners, leading to for example not voicing all concerns or problems and overstating some of the plans and results.
- Required adjustment of plans and delays or postponement of activities due to not getting NOCs, replacement of partners, and other unforeseen external, political and policy related challenges. This naturally effected the outcomes of the project.
- A reduced scope for gender transformative skills development by young people due to unconsciously traditional gender norm-conforming facilitators. Gender and social norm changes as promoted by the EYW project require a longer time that the remainder of the project can provide for.
- The project is highly complex and operates through very high numbers of activities. It is implemented in a very tight timeframe, with each activity contributing to one element of the total project plan. But not all elements are or even can be implemented simultaneously. Some elements are not implemented as part of the organic linkages the project had foreseen and hence the overall goal will be difficult to achieve. The number of activities has proven to be too high to realize in the given time and context, also caused by the late start of implementation of activities.
- Some challenges are a consequence of the learning process inherently connected to the project, the teams and the staff involved at different levels of project implementation but also to the high level of ambition and over-optimism of achieving social changes in the given limited time.
- Postponement of activities has been the dominant coping mechanism of delays, such as conflicts and NOCs. At this point in time, the project has not yet reached the maturity needed to realize the planned long-term outcomes. In addition to the high number of activities, the timeframe of the project is too short to realize the potential of the project and reach the goals and objectives of the project.

Main follow-up actions global level:

- There is consensus that the holistic ToC is unique and appreciated by all stakeholders, but also too ambitious in relation to the available time. We are looking at simplifying some elements of the project.
- Valuable learnings we take on board are the recommendations around certain thematic areas that need further attention in some regions, among others the EYW teams will work on mainstreaming: climate change; facilitation skills of the field staff; ways of bringing in required expertise; further attention to the function and definition of youth groups.
- We will also more explicitly test the assumptions underlying the ToC in our monitoring process.
- A large focus on targets and numbers is felt. This discussion was already ongoing in the project and measures to take pressure off and to prioritize quality over quantity - recalculated outreach, context specific decisions on the ratio between boys and girls beneficiaries - have already been taken and communicated to IKEA Foundation.
- Due to the unforeseen challenges and related delays, more time is needed than originally planned to achieve what the programme set out to do within the given time and realize the scope for its sustainable continuation. As such, the MTE recommends to soon start planning beyond the present project period, to prevent a gap in support for activities, necessary to

achieve the long-term objectives. We will start looking into planning beyond present project period.

Main follow-up actions EYW Pakistan

The most relevant MTE recommendations for EYW Pakistan include the revision of the life skills module through inclusion of more components around critical thinking, facilitation skills, climate change impact: this involves a shift from a training to a learning approach. In addition, EYW Pakistan will revive local steering committee meetings and create more space for partners for constructive reflection and feedback during reviews. Moreover, adding a new technical partner to execute SME Business Development Support will further strengthen this component. Finally, specialized engagement will be done to execute value chain and market linkages.

In addition, the following specific actions will be prioritized: Engagement with government and private sector technical institutes to cover technical training aspects followed by job placements and execution of E-jobs program as an alternate option to provide diverse job opportunities to young people at their door step. Moreover, strengthening agency and social empowerment of young people will be done to generate collective voices through the structured roll out of GALS¹. After-care package post trainings will be strengthened to support young people in accessing jobs and business markets. Furthermore, work on registration of the innovation hubs for sustainability purposes and establishing mechanisms to strengthen the access to finance component will also be done to strengthen overall program in Pakistan.

Main follow-up actions EYW Indonesia

In Indonesia, recommendations and actions around climate change are prioritized. The climate change component will be tackled by a new specialized organization and BDS organization with expertise in People Planet Profit (PPP). SRHR and GBV issues will be addressed through a different approach (other than soft skills training), such as campaigning or youth dialogues. It requires more time, a safe space for youth and additional support. Learning activities with and between partners have been planned and the addition of a new specialized organisation to support on this. In addition, the Indonesia team will facilitate a feedback mechanism every quarter, and focus on creating more dialogue to open up sensitive discussions and prioritize quality over quantity.

Main follow-up actions EYW Bangladesh

The most relevant MTE recommendations for EYW Bangladesh include to develop the capacity of youth peers as well as project staff to increase their facilitation skills. In addition, the revision of the soft skills module to reflect the needs of youth to learn more about SRHR, GBV and other issues that will help them to bring positive change in their lives. Moreover, to encourage partners and youth to provide feedback and share their learning and challenges. Finally, to focus more on understanding the link between building blocks of EYW project. The following specific actions are prioritized: more focus on providing training on climate resilient, mitigation and adaptation related skills. In addition, vocational training courses on plumbing, masonry, carpentry, mobile phone repairing, solar technology for youth who participated in mentorship/non-certified vocational /certified training through partners. Also, a business incubator consultant will be hired to facilitate youth starts up and focus will be given to adopt climate adaptation and mitigation practices.

Main follow-up actions EYW Ethiopia

The most relevant recommendations and actions in Ethiopia, include the provision of climate change, SRHR, GBV and Unpaid Care Work (UCW) technical training to implementing partners, community conversation facilitators and stakeholder offices. In addition, SRHR, GBV and UCW (e.g. cooking, caring) will continue to be implemented in already ongoing community conversations and

¹ GALS: Gender Action Learning System

school clubs rather than incorporating it into life skill training. Refresher trainings for implementing partners, respective stakeholders and beneficiaries on BDS will be provided to address business plan and financial linkage issues. The project will also increase its influencing work on youth financial inclusion. Moreover, there will be an increased focus on regular monitoring and technical support on the Loan Guarantee Fund (LGF) and regular project implementation quality checks via monitoring and technical support.

2. Summary of quality assessment of the MTE process and report

- The overall quality of the evaluation is mixed. The report provides various valuable lessons, conclusions and recommendations which have already been taken up by country office teams and PMU. However, after two rounds of thorough feedback, still the report is lengthy, and chapters are repetitive and not well structured. The language is technical and generally more targeted towards Oxfam and donors, rather than towards the intended in-country stakeholders.
- Reported findings do not address all the questions as defined in the evaluation scope, for example, the programme-wide questions were not addressed: Does the global/multi-country layer of the programme fulfil its roles in terms of oversight and management as well as on influencing, MEAL and innovation? What trends emerge across countries?
- Moreover, as requested in the ToR, a systematic analysis of the achievements of outcomes LTO2 and LTO3 and a proper validation of the ToC pathways with analysis whether interventions are leading to the expected change, is missing.
- The sheer number of recommendations (52 on the global level, in addition to national level recommendations) is overwhelming and to follow them up would further complicate the project, these should have been prioritized and narrowed down.
- With regards to the methodology, transparency on data collection methodologies and analysis is lacking. The report does not present evidence that adequate measures were taken to ensure data quality, including evidence supporting the reliability and validity of data collection tools such as interview protocols, an analysis framework, and sampling frame. In addition, the anonymized dataset as deliverable from the ToR has also not been delivered. The report does not include a discussion of how a mix of data sources was used to obtain a diversity of perspectives with triangulation of data, ensuring data accuracy and overcome data limits.
- With regards to the quality of the MTR assessment, Oxfam concludes that the level of participation of partners and beneficiaries in the different stages of the evaluation process is sufficient overall. However, interviews with Oxfam Novib staff have not been sufficiently reflected in the report. The sample is fairly representative, although it focuses mainly on youth from the project that are engaged in LTO 1, and less on other stakeholders. Moreover, no trainings or project activities have been visited during the evaluation. Conclusions are mainly based on group discussions with youth. Methodologies as agreed in inception report, have not been carried out.
- Various key factual mistakes in the MTE report remain; please see chapter 4 for corrections.

3. Summary of Oxfam's response and actions per MTE recommendation

	Recommendation's from MTE	Response from EYW	Proposed actions by EYW ²
	1. Effectiveness		
1.	Focus on activities and implementation time lines that are realistic to achieve and relate to the context and age-specific needs of the young women and men being served. For example, prioritize the focus on soft skills trainings and learning from pilots and consider providing trainings on hard skills after an appropriate foundation has been built, with respect to gendered attitudes and behaviour. Such a change in activities need not impact the timeline negatively, as the types of training can still be implemented in parallel in the latter part of the remaining time. The project has a timeline, which should be used strategically - not all aspects of the ToC must be touched on at the same time. The total time available, however, is not likely to be adequate to complete all that is still foreseen towards the ultimate goal.	EYW agrees and acknowledges the importance to focus on activities and implementation timelines that are realistic to achieve and relate to the needs of youth. The recommendations are in line with ongoing implementation and strategy.	EYW continues to prepare and review the country workplans and closely monitor sequencing of activities. EYW maintains the flexibility to adjust the focus of activities where possible and necessary. EYW will also continue to engage with specialists and partners to reach its goals.
2.	In addition, the project's timeline should allow implementing partners to zoom in on elements of the project that prepare for other elements or can be linked to other specialised local partners. Hence, the project should allow for increased focus on activities that have the best potential for leverage and that are fundamental in reaching the project's objectives. For example, by involving agencies specialised in conducting training on SRHR and GBV prevention, so that the	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation and EYW will continue ongoing actions.	Some of the ongoing actions in EYW include: In Indonesia topics related to SRHR and GBV will be integrated through community and youth dialogues and campaigns. Bangladesh will focus on including SRHR and GBV topics in the soft skills training together with youth peers who will facilitate these trainings. EYW Pakistan will hire a new technical partner to execute the SME BDS support component of the project and consultancy services

² Overall EYW actions will be coordinated by PMU, country specific actions are mentioned separately.

	implementing partner can focus on creating job opportunities and skills training.		of more relevant players e.g., engaging with an e-job service provider, banks for financial access, and specialized organizations for market linkages. For Hub trainings, EYW Pakistan is exploring options to digitize its module and execute an online version. In Ethiopia, ToT trainings have already been planned for field level partner project staff, volunteer facilitators and influential leaders to effectively undertake regular and continues community level conversations on issues of SRHR, GBV and unpaid care work.
3.	<p>Youth participation and representation has different implications at different levels of the project and for concrete practices. Requirements for support may be different dependent on the level of operation and purpose and the local context. Questions to be considered during planning for the next project phase should include: ‘How should youth participation be interpreted on different levels?’, ‘What are the implications of such different interpretations of youth participation?’ and ‘What is the best way to embody youth participation for reaching specific goals?’ New strategies for support may need to be considered related to local gender-responsive opportunities and contexts. For example, involve older and higher educated youth in research activities to link climate change mitigation, covering modern agricultural techniques and preparing for disasters as a result of climate change, to job opportunities, in partnership with scientific institutions.</p> <p>The project does well in incorporating young people and focusing on youth participation. This focus should remain and strengthened where possible. For example, youth participation can be made more meaningful by supporting learning and facilitating the needs of youth by engaging young people</p>	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW will continue with meaningful youth participation and representation at different levels of the project.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.

	themselves in and facilitating processes of reflection, discussion and learning. The project should work from the understanding that young people already have knowledge and life experience and build on that experience.		
4.	Young people (the lower age category) in some locations have requested spaces to meet, share and learn. Hubs may offer a great opportunity to have such a space, unless the hub is meant to be a commercial self-financing unit catering to business development only. Rather than planning activities in a top-down format, allow for youth-driven activities based on what they want and need at that specific point in time.	EYW does not agree. All youth hubs are designed through the HCD method. Consequently, they are youth driven as from the initial stage youth groups defined what types of hubs they want to build. Hubs are therefore not top-down. They are also already used as a space for young people to meet, learn, share and to strategize for youth leaders. For instance, in Pakistan both the Hubs have cafeteria facilities. Youth leaders replicate them and use space of their home as mini hubs for social activities.	In Bangladesh the Union Apex body members are taking initiatives to influence local government to allocate a space for hubs. In Rajshahi they already received a space at Union Parishad premise. In Pakistan, few additional initiatives will be taken, such as placing board games at the Hub to enhance social interaction of young people, especially young girls. EYW Indonesia will keep using the HCD methods to create youth hubs and will continue to engage government and other stakeholders to support the hubs.
5.	In relation to SRHR and GBV, consider elements of the life skills training to be introduced (by specialised agencies) at earlier ages, such as gender normative behaviour, menstrual hygiene, boys' wet dreams, etc. as requested by youth themselves that never had such information, and in preparation of their next life stage as young adolescents.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
6.	Rather than providing trainings because they are in line with the project's plans, trainings should focus on young people's priorities. For example, and in line with young female's requests, trainings should be facilitated and provided to boys and young men about adequately sharing household and family care tasks: youth themselves, boys and girls shared that there is a need to have special skills training for boys in cooking, caring, etc.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
7.	Much emphasised by beneficiaries in project countries, the project should review the role of parents, teachers and local leaders in maintaining and reinforcing gender roles and address more integrally in the project than presently done.	EYW partially agrees: EYW is already working integrally with the wider community on addressing gender roles and will continue to do so, for instance	In Bangladesh, the number of family level discussions will be increased with intergeneration dialogues. EYW Pakistan will continue with interactive theatre campaigns and young people

		with GALS, family level discussions and community dialogues.	will replicate GALS sessions in households, specifically targeting men's engagement and elderly women. EYW Indonesia will continue with GALS, which engages all household members and the wider community. It will also set up a discussion forum for youth and parents and provide basic gender lessons to teachers and trainers to make sure they don't reinforce gender inequality. In Ethiopia, this is already being addressed through regular bi-weekly community conversations and school clubs.
8.	Workshops on key events related to different life stages, such as dating safety, marriage, pregnancy, child bearing and rearing, for example through young (expecting) couples training as requested in different EYW project areas. Avoid simply adding these trainings to the list of activities but aim to include the topics in existing planned trainings or critically review planned trainings to see if they add value and answer felt needs.	EYW partially agrees: Topics such as family planning discussions are already embedded under SRHR, GALS components and family level discussions.	In Bangladesh, additional couple meetings will be arranged as part of family level discussion where these topics will be discussed in detail. In Pakistan, no further action is feasible due to the sensitivity of topics. EYW Indonesia will continue implementation through GALS activities, youth and community dialogue and several campaign materials. In Ethiopia, this will be implemented in combination with ongoing project activities, such as family level dialogues.
9.	Country Offices and Implementing Partners' staff should review their roles, attitudes and perceptions on prevailing social norms and values and reflect on the way these influence their professional and personal roles played in the EYW project to prevent contradicting the transformative actions towards gender justice principles which the project set out to promote. Learning is an important component of the project. The GLE are an important opportunity for learning and exchanges as they create a platform for discussion and for generating a sense of ownership. They must remain a part of the project. During the	See table merged recommendations EYW agrees that the GLE's are important opportunities for learning and exchanges. Realizing that current differences between project countries are due to unfortunate circumstances, at the last	See table merged recommendations EYW will continue efforts to prevent negative competition at the GLE's.

	global learning event, the negative sense of competition between project countries about their project implementation and successes needs to be prevented, as the contexts and opportunities differ too much.	GLE it was made very clear that each country could deliver only what the context allowed, competition was not encouraged. Competition has only been promoted with fun team building activities.	
10.	Rather than instructing participants on topics that require reflection, dialogue and deep learning, training activities should encourage generation of knowledge and critical awareness by young people themselves. The focus in these fields should be on facilitating learning by developing young people's critical minds based on project related topics and transformative gender norms and related behaviour.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
11.	Trainers, willing and able to facilitate such learning culture, daring to challenge dominant traditions should be invited to be part of the project. These trainers should be trained to facilitate learning process. They should remain flexible in their approach to young people and about topics young people want to discuss. The good practice cited, related to Paulo Freire should be considered as it can help understand the difference between teaching and learning. Freire argued that dialogue is necessary for making a difference in the world - it is important as it can be seen to enhance communities and for building social capital. A more practical example that embodies Freire's approach and thinking, are programmes that incorporate MYP. Initially, youth are equipped with basic knowledge on specific topics after which they can become involved as youth leaders, youth influencers, youth as service providers, youth as co-researchers and/or youth as peer educators/facilitators, based on youth's own insights, experiences and critical thinking.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
12.	The project is new in its approach in various regions; it should be celebrated. Oxfam Novib and Country Offices should not hold back in reporting about achievements and youth	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. Reflection and learning based on reporting will remain an	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.

	participation, but equally: share about the difficulties faced and the time required so that expectations can be adequately managed. This way, learning from and reflection based on reporting could become more significant and profound.	important agenda point of bilateral meetings and the GLE.	
13.	<p>The unequal power positions of Oxfam Novib as a recipient of funds from IKEA and vis-à-vis Country Offices as funder and these country offices vis-à-vis the Implementing Partners must continue to be addressed. Money means power and will always influence the space to share different views.</p> <p>Partnership relations require clear ToRs for the space, responsibilities and limitations in decision-making that each party has. Continue emphasising the space for critical thinking, feedback and flexibility, rather than focusing on production targets as stipulated in contracts.</p>	<p>EYW agrees: EYW will continue to emphasise the space for critical thinking, feedback and flexibility, rather than focusing on the production of targets and will continue to ensure that all relations are properly formalized in contracts, ToRs and workplans. While realizing that power differences cannot be taken away completely, EYW will continue to address hierarchies openly. For instance by creating a safe space at GLE and in (bi lateral) meetings, and at all activities that will be organized. However, these hierarchies partially consist of money relations that hold power but at the same time are formed by accountability relations where the powerholders take responsibility for account management and for the associated financial risks, this cannot be avoided.</p>	<p>EYW will continue to address hierarchies openly. EYW Bangladesh will focus on coordination meetings and field visits to provide the opportunity to share learning and receive feedback from both partners and Oxfam to ensure quality outcomes. Pakistan will ensure the revival of a steering group that comprised of all partner's head and Oxfam team leads to jointly reflect on challenges and take strategic actions. In addition, a review meeting is planned more on strategic level, on how to move forward with implementation while tackling all the different challenges. Joint reflection and action formulation will give ownership and feeling of joint power.</p> <p>In Indonesia a consensus has been made to prioritize quality over quantity. The coming year will focus on space for dialogue with partners and every quarter a review meeting will be held, which will include a feedback mechanism for every partner and Oxfam.</p> <p>EYW Ethiopia will continue with quarterly joint monitoring and annual performance review meetings with partners, various government and private sector stakeholders, beneficiaries and YABs. A joint workplan has been prepared with clear roles and responsibilities. Frequent consultation meetings will also be held as per the need and field level monitoring results.</p>

14.	As climate change resilience and adaptation in relation to entrepreneurship development is an area in need of additional focus and knowledge, it is recommended to make the availability of that knowledge in the TA Pool a visible focus, thereby attracting the COs and IPs to request for training in these fields. They can bring innovation in the agro-industry as well as other forms of small or larger job creating industrial production in line with sustainable development principles at micro and macro level.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
2. Relevance			
15.	The project does well in incorporating young people and focusing on youth participation. This focus should remain and strengthened where possible. For example, youth participation can be made more meaningful by supporting learning and facilitating the needs of youth by engaging young people themselves in and facilitating processes of reflection, discussion and learning. The project should work from the understanding that young people already have knowledge and life experience and build on that experience.	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. No response needed. EYW will remain its focus on incorporating young people and focusing on meaningful youth participation at different levels of the project.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
16.	The project should remain flexible enough to incorporate changes that young people suggest or want, for example in topics for soft skills or refresher sessions. Likewise, the budget can facilitate such flexibility and be used to strengthen the bottom-up approach. Learnings, insights and ideas generated from previous activities and outcomes to shift money between budget lines. Consider also efficient allocation of budgetary space for innovative activities, learning approaches and researches, such as TVET training for new, marketable skills, presently not offered, but of interest to young people.	EYW partially Agrees. Changes are continuously incorporated in activities, for instance after baseline and midline findings. In addition, various activities are designed with input from youth, for instance with HCD methods. EYW maintains flexibility for changes and discussions are taking place to strategically balance the diversified demands and needs from young men and women with the flexible offer and resources available, but cannot cater for all the changes and suggestions of all the youth.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.

		Moreover, the recommendation to consider efficient allocation of budgetary space for innovative activities, learning approaches and researches, is completely in line with ongoing implementation.	
17.	In relation to the above and directly related to the ToC, trainings should focus on skills, for which opportunities exist or what the market demands, but where they are inadequately addressed. Market research in and outside of project localities for preparation or expansion of existing employment opportunities could contribute to a better understanding of demand. Market research should focus on the link between climate mitigation and employment and could be done in co-operation with scientific institutions for employment and self-employment. Additional soft skill training on labour rights should be provided. Promoting businesses and job opportunities that contradict sustainable development in relation to climate change mitigation should be avoided.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
18.	The ToC's assumptions must be further tested in each country and in each context and adjusted based on outcomes of the tests, as commonalities between contexts cannot not be assumed. The ToC is holistic, and the focus should remain holistic. However, clarity and clear linking between the three ToC's pillars and project activities is necessary. For example, the project may research the relations between gender and climate change, and hence the gendered impact of climate change on women and men and hence the need for gendered mitigation processes. It is better to be focussed and clear on the need for specific activities at a specific time rather than wanting to do many things at once, because of contractual commitments, as this will affect the project's quality.	EYW partially agrees. Assumptions are regularly tested; formally through baseline, midline and qualitative researches, and informally during activities by implementing partners. In particular, the baseline and midline studies focus on the relation between the three TOC pillars. Activities are adjusted based on the outcomes of these tests. Testing of assumptions is monitored quarterly in the quarterly reports and country reports.	EYW will more explicitly test the assumptions underlying the ToC in each context in our monitoring process and ensure clarity and clear linking between the three ToC's pillars and project activities if necessary. This can be included in GLE and partner review meetings agenda's.

19.	<p>Project teams should continue and further develop activities considering the question: 'What are the assumptions of each method towards reaching the suggested outcome and have these assumptions been tested to show those results?'</p> <p>In turn, interventions must reflect the concrete gender differentiated experiences and views of the young people themselves and be based on feedback from country offices and implementing partners. This way, the project's interventions will continue to be based on decisions about the objectives and goals the project wants to reach and considerations around whether chosen methods are adequate to help the project reach set key objectives.</p>	<p>EYW partially agrees. See response on recommendation 18 about assumptions.</p> <p>The second part of the recommendation is incorrect, as interventions are proposed and designed at country office and implementing partner level and are thus not based on feedback from them.</p>	<p>No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.</p>
20.	<p>The report introduces good practices, which could support strengthening the project and implementation. Important lessons that Oxfam Novib, country offices and implementing partners could learn from relate to (i) the age of young people and the way young people are included as beneficiaries in their different life stages, (ii) how young men are being engaged, for which purposes and how young men may be included or supported to benefit gender justice as well as equality for young women, (iii) learning, linking and building on existing programmes and (iv) how innovation can be done on a small scale and in a simple way, yet work towards empowering the marginalised and otherwise excluded for the benefit of themselves and their environment.</p>	<p>EYW agrees that good practices could support strengthening the project and implementation. EYW was already familiar with some of the introduced good practices and implemented them, such as through the E-motive visit.</p>	<p>EYW will continue to learn from good practices, for instance through peer to peer learning, E-motive, exchange learning between partners, and expert visits to ensure cross learning. PMU will continue to stimulate the reflection on good practices in the different countries of EYW and from other successful projects, as part of its ongoing learning process.</p>
21.	<p>The GLE could provide a platform for thinking outside the box. Oxfam Novib could include an HCD partner in the process to facilitate this. Topics to be considered for out of the box thinking in relation to the project could be linking climate change mitigation and adaptation to work opportunities, hypothesizing life stages and how these may affect and be incorporated into the project's activities, how to reach LTOs by</p>	<p>EYW agrees. The GLE is already meant as a platform to provide thinking outside the box. Cross-cutting topics that have been included in previous GLEs are for instance climate change mitigation and adaptation, and meaningful youth participation in the programme. The topics for the GLE are always</p>	<p>Through a survey and follow-up calls the upcoming GLE agenda is being developed in consultation with country offices and implementing partners. Hypothesizing life stages and how these may affect and be incorporated into the project's activities has been proposed and could be selected as one of the topics for the GLE.</p>

	aide of other LTOs and how young people may be included in the process and empowered along the way. Country offices and implementing partners should be encouraged to suggest topics for such discussions.	decided in coordination with the EYW country teams.	
22.	In relation to partners and youth participation, in going forward the project should seek to include as much as possible local partners, who already have links to young people in the regions. Partners should be supported, and their skills upgraded so that the bottom-up approach can be strengthened and be even more participatory. In this light, country offices and implementing partners must be vocal about knowledge gaps and training needs, without fear of appearing weak.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
23.	In terms of trainings and discussions with young people, implementing partners and trainers should be trained to address and facilitate discussions about sensitive issues, such as cyber bullying as well as topics that young people in their different life stages request. In addition, refresher sessions on life skills should be an added component to the project, as requested by many youths.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
24.	Questions on climate change and how young people' economic opportunities and gender relations are affected by it should be included in the endline survey. Alternatively, a research or study on this topic could be conducted, which could feed into the project and its activities. Involving youth themselves in such a study may raise or increase their level of interest in climate change issues: 1) how their lives will be affected by climate change 2) how their choice of jobs, businesses, agricultural production methods or lifestyles may help or hinder climate change and its potential mitigation and 3) how they can contribute to mitigation and resilience as part of the larger scheme of changes the project aims for.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations

	3. Efficiency		
25.	In light of the remaining two years of the project, allow for critical thinking and planning about social and gender transformative change processes that are key to achieving the objectives of EYW the project. This could include a youth-led research on social norms, including how different reference networks may influence the creation of, or changing of social norms, or reinforce existing norms.	EYW Agrees critical thinking and planning about social and gender transformative change processes is important to achieving the objectives of the programme. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation and EYW will continue doing this.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
26.	Going forward, the project may include the strategic approach of organised diffusion, which means sharing of knowledge as that can be a fruitful strategy to increase the reach of community discussions, ultimately helping interventions achieve effective social norms change.	EYW partially agrees. EYW acknowledges the importance of sharing of knowledge as a fruitful strategy to increase the reach of community discussions, ultimately helping interventions achieve effective social norms change. However, the programme has been working with different methods to achieve this such as GALS, social norms diagnostic tool, peer to peer learning, E-motive. At this stage of the programme it is therefore not feasible to include another approach and again train facilitators (see also 23 at table merged response).	No further action.
27.	Continue wide-reaching media campaigns amplifying the voice of young people	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW will continue with campaigns to amplify the voice of young people.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
28.	Acknowledge the diversity of the category youth 15-29, and understand their different needs for knowledge, skills, time to reflect, hubs to meet, desire to be part of a group, through in-depth analysis of the age range and its intersection with other influencing factors such as sex, class, education, ability, minority status, and others and what the needs and opportunities are for relevant and effective interventions.	EYW partially agrees. EYW already acknowledges the diversity of the category youth. Interventions are tailor made to the needs of the youth, from module creation up to implementation, youth are involved for their input. HCD and other participatory mappings have been used to understand the different needs of the youth and community. Diversity in age range is considered in every project	In Bangladesh, ward group youth members will organize a small group discussion on soft skills contents to better understand needs of the youth. In Pakistan the social norms diagnostic tool can shed some light on this aspect as it covered quite diverse groups and the project learned about their diversity aspects. In Indonesia, learning activities will take place to increase the capacity of partners dealing

	Focus on selective/strategic participation of youth in activities relevant to their needs.	activity. A complete change in strategy is not possible at this stage of the programme, however on country level some specific action will be taken on youth diversity and needs.	with the diversity of youth. EYW Ethiopia, will continue to consider diversity in age range, including while preparing ToRs for project activities in the coming years of the project.
29.	While keeping the gender unequal starting positions of women and men clearly in mind, actively relax the 70:30 female to male ratio, not so much related to whether it is feasible to maintain the ration, but in line with young people's - girls and boys - expressed priorities and suggestions to contribute to gender justice: some activities specifically for young women, others for young men and others for mixed groups, so that both sexes can share an agenda for transformative action towards gender justice in the relationships, in care, in household chores etc.	EYW partially Agrees. At the last GLE the 70:30 ratio has been carefully discussed. It is not a rigid fixing and has already been actively relaxed. The COs and IPs decided jointly to keep the ambition, but to adjust the ratio in case this is not possible or constructive based on the situation at hand.	Continue with adjusting the ratio in cases where it is not possible to achieve this or when it affects the quality of the work.
30.	Introduce a focus on reference networks and their importance for young people and explore how (different) reference networks may cause and promote changes in behaviour rather than maintaining inequalities. A greater understanding of reference networks will promote efficiency in project implementation, as it should be used to direct and strategically plan for interventions. Not all interventions are equally important for all groups nor should they be. Continue asking questions to youth on expected and perceived behaviour which will refer to friend groups, family, strangers, or other relevant actors and formulated in such a way that they test perceived behaviour in relation to these differing actors. Conclusions may then be drawn on how behaviour shifts and where interventions are likely to have the greatest impact for social change.	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW will continue its focus on reference networks (e.g. community members) in end-line survey and regular monitoring.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
31.	Subsequent to providing soft skills for the younger youth, mostly still in school, review the available skills' needs for which training is already provided today and start providing additional skills training that meet new market needs and aspirations of youth that have already passed through the soft skills and are	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations

	at a life stage and motivation level, where they can benefit from innovative/modern techniques in agriculture, animal husbandry, poultry, as well as in housing and drinking water management, solar and other energy sources as well as electronic skills as required. Modern house building skills, including carpentry, plumbing/sanitation, masonry, electric wiring, etc. that are not made available, but in demand for employment opportunities require attention too.		
32.	Design modules for training only when it is known in which areas young people lack knowledge and what their questions and challenges are. This changes over time and in relation to their social settings, education level etc. When young people are included in the design and testing phases of the modules, they become active owners of the learning processes: they can advise on possible gaps in knowledge creation and awareness raising. The engagement in the testing and advising is both an empowering and learning process, hence an active method of empowering that can be repeated time and again. Youth can also be involved in developing and testing mobile phone-based video material for such training as requested by many young people. Some youth may want to be trained as facilitator or peer-trainer. In addition, Country Offices and Implementing Partners need to consult with CSOs in the country that have proven track records of developing effective training modules and its related ToT, in order to maximise effectiveness of the investments made.	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW will continue its activities such as including youth in designing and testing of activities.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
33.	Whenever possible and available, Country Offices should prioritise local specialists as consultants for EYW work as a mixed team with an international expert to bring in exposure and experiences that are new. If the international TA can be hired to upgrade the knowledge and consulting skills of local or regional TA providers a dual purpose can be served: increasing	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW will continue to bring in the expertise of local consultants and TA's, and allocate budget.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.

	the local expertise and contributing to innovation. Distance between consultants and users of the expertise should be kept small as relationship building and trust is required for the advice to be effective and subsequently owned. Oxfam Novib may need to allocate budget to country offices for this when required. For the sake of sustainability TA from Europe should never be hired without a local counterpart to be trained, women or men.		
34.	Country offices and implementing partners should continue to consider MTE outcomes and learnings not only related to their own countries as referred to in the country chapters in this report, but to other countries as well. Their contexts may differ, but they still share project goals and objectives. Not for a copy/paste intervention approaches, but for understanding and learning.	See table merged recommendations.	See table merged recommendations.
35.	Each country office should calculate cost efficiency. Though cost efficiency usually relates to the number of direct beneficiaries, while some activities do not directly involve or benefit young people, country offices should consider how expenses now will benefit the project's outcomes and young people in the future. They should consider the question 'Is this cost a worthy investment?', 'What needs to happen to make this cost a worthy investment?' and 'How will we consider this cost to be worthy?'.	EYW Agrees. Calculating cost efficiency will bring in added value. Due to delays in the first year there was no point in calculating this at earlier times. Currently the programme finds itself at the right time to calculate cost efficiency, in line with the outreach and expenditure following the upcoming annual report.	Cost efficiency will be calculated for each country and EYW teams and partners will reflect on this.
36.	To ensure that the final stage of learning and overall learning is done effectively and efficiently, it is necessary to allow for more time overall and in-country and a larger budget, more time and for a larger team of evaluators to conduct the final evaluation of the EYW project. The current review team suggests at least 15 working days in each country, especially considering time required for local travel and the requirement of including all stakeholders' voices. For the end evaluation to be most	EYW partially agrees. The mid-term evaluation has been done in 10 days in each country, as proposed by the evaluators. While EYW preferred parallel country visits by two evaluators, the consultants planned for all country visits to be done by one evaluator while ensuring quality also after critical questions about this by EYW. EYW will ensure evaluators will travel parallel for the end	No further action needed.

	effective, the end-line survey should be completed in each of the four countries, prior to the start of the external evaluation.	evaluation to ensure effective and efficient learning and evaluation methods will be reviewed. The midline survey could not be done as planned for Pakistan and Indonesia due to external circumstances. The end line survey will be completed before the end evaluation, if external circumstances allow it.	
	4. Sustainability		
37.	Develop an info sheet for young people explaining why Oxfam Novib and IKEA Foundation - and hence this project - works and wants to work with them. Such an info sheet will support buy-in and understanding among young people, thus support sustainable youth participation and ownership of the project' results.	EYW agrees that informing young people about the reasons behind the programme is always good.	EYW will continue informing young people about the reasons behind the programme and look into ways of how to do this best (for instance an info sheet, but more likely through online information sharing by keeping websites and Facebook pages updated and using social media).
38.	Projects with a fixed timeframe - for practical contractual reasons - are a dot on a long line of change processes desired. But in acknowledgement of societal, cultural and gendered norms and values taking a long time to change, projects of limited duration, but intending to affect long-term changes, require extensions to be effective: totalling 10 to 15 years. Hence, Oxfam Novib and country offices should already consider and plan for a next phase of the project. This will prevent a collapse of the project outcomes before maturation can be achieved and sustainable structures and systems are in place. It will also prevent frustration and distrust of CSOs among the young women and men served by this project.	EYW partially agrees. The fact that (social) change needs time is obvious and in the TOC EYW has been clear that social change could not happen overnight but that the project is working towards this change. The project team compliments the IKEA Foundation to embark with us on this innovative high risk project. Also through the results of this evaluation, for EYW and partners it is clear that our approach is valid and that we are moving in the right direction and that more time will be needed to reach full impact and to fully capitalize on the established contacts with youth and other stakeholders.	EYW will design a second phase and assume talks with IKEA Foundation and other possible donors to secure funding.
39.	Contracts with implementing partners and other partner institutions must be signed prior to starting their work. Responsibilities of each partner and implementing	EYW does not agree: As EYW is a complex and multi-layered program, approving workplans and budgets and contracting requires time and clarity of	Current modalities will remain in place. In Bangladesh the Country office government relation

	organisation towards country offices and other partners must be clear, transparent, simple and straightforward. No contract must mean no work. If delays in project planning and/or Government clearance for funding are expected to take long, Country offices should seek to ensure cashflow and security of future contracts at partner levels through temporary contracts.	the financial situation of the previous year is needed for this. If partners would halt the work during this process, staff would need to be released and re-recruited, the relation with beneficiaries and stakeholders would be disturbed and the project would face delays. The partners are aware of the gap between contracts and receive written confirmation that contracts will be extended and if needed, bridging funds are provided.	officer will keep communication with the NGOAB to ensure fund clearance as fast as feasible.
40.	Facilitate additional orientation of country office and implementing partner staff, in understanding what others - specialised CSOs, experts, government departments, private sector - know and can contribute in expertise and skills as part of a close collaboration and jointly working to achieve common goals.	EYW agrees. This is a continuous process and is happening right now as well as where partners are working jointly with other relevant actors including experts, Government and private sector institutes especially in skill development of young people. However, the EYW programme is also in year 4 and therefore needs to be realistic about new partnerships as they are time consuming in establishing and maintaining.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
41.	Staff happiness, professional development and job security in view of retaining staff and increasing staff strength and building appropriate experience as a team must be addressed. This will allow for a stronger project team that is empowered to reach the goals and objectives of the project.	EYW agrees to the importance of staff well-being. At country office, implementing partner and PMU levels, responsibility lies with line management. The project team will continue flagging with responsible line managers if they notice any risk/issue related to the well being of EYW colleagues. Oxfam is also following up on a culture survey at all levels, both Oxfam Novib and the Country Offices.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
42.	Whereas the ToC specifies “Young women and men are part of well-functioning, sustainable youth groups” as part of the EYW approach, attention is required for further defining specific goals, reasons and conditions for organising youth in groups. This will promote the building of functional groups, as desired by the youth, in response to their short or longer term needs to	EYW partially agrees. EYW is already doing this on intervention level. Youth groups have specific goals, reasons and conditions for organising, linked to their own needs. Groups in all accounts have been very successful in increasing youth agency as mentioned in the conclusion of this MTE.	In Bangladesh implementing partners are revisiting all groups to assess the effective roles of the group members and facilitating the process of preparing their own action plan where each members needs and roles will be identified explicitly. EYW Pakistan will continue to Define ToRs of Youth Leaders and Youth Group Members clearly outlining

	be a member of a group. Young people's own needs should be guiding this process.	EYW Pakistan is already signing engagement contracts with youth leaders that very clearly define their long term and short-term roles. In Indonesia the need for youth groups is coming from youth themselves. Most of the project youth had already set up their own groups. EYW has youth champions or leaders who are able lead youth groups. In Ethiopia, every youth group is legally registered and has developed bylaws where their vision, roles and responsibilities are indicated.	social actions. They will specifically formulate their ToRs as a group so that they may have clear roles and guidelines for collective action. In Ethiopia, implementing partners will further assess this and provide technical support if needed.
43.	Project pilots should continue as they can provide innovation, new insights and new ways of working: They are great learning tools. Therefore, they require time for critical reflection and adjustments. Flexibility and space is key and should be included in project planning going forward. Pilots by their very nature run the risk of failing. Pilots should therefore be added activities that, when successful, can be incorporated to strengthen the project and its outcomes and subsequently be linked to specific project activities when useful.	EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW will continue with project pilots and flexibility and space to make adjustments when needed.	No further action needed as recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation.
44.	The project's plans going forward must allow time to jointly reflect on MTE findings and to build relationships between Country Offices and between Country Offices and Implementing Partners as equals for a common objective and with shared responsibilities, but different roles.	See table merged recommendations.	See table merged recommendations.
45.	Oxfam Novib should consider inviting IKEA Foundation to be part of learning events, planning workshops and reflection periods and to directly experience the positive impact, such as soft skills training, has on young people's empowerment. IKEA Foundation is as much part of the project as partners are and outcomes, processes, challenges and opportunities should therefore be shared with all stakeholders at every level. Hence, they have equal interest in learning and working with stakeholders on different levels. By acknowledging this, Oxfam	EYW agrees. The team has continually invited the IKEA Foundation staff members to join on country visits, to have regular calls or to join meetings at Oxfam Novib head quarters and will continue doing so. In addition, all papers detailing the learning in the project are being shared with IKEA Foundation as soon as they become available. As IKEA Foundation is restructuring currently the capacity	When IKEA Foundation will join events and field visits, EYW will do its best to create an open and safe atmosphere with space for critical reflection by youth, implementing partners and Oxfam teams.

	Novib, Country Offices, Implementing Partners and young people must not hold back in sharing their views, insights and ideas. This is a mutual choice, mutual decision and shared responsibility of all involved. The more all the partners, including IKEA, share not only successes and achievements but also challenges, setbacks and failures, the better they understand what can, and what cannot be expected as outcomes within the given time and budget.	has been limited and field visits have not been prioritized. IKEA Foundation is welcome and has been invited to join part of the upcoming Global Learning Event.	
	5. Partnerships		
46.	To encourage MYP, skills and capacities of several staff members of the Implementing Partners, but also of Country Offices, to work with youth in a truly participatory and empowering way require to be further developed, enhanced, supervised and subsequently mature.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
47.	Based on an inventory of each Implementing Partner's own realisation that they lack adequate and necessary skills and knowledge in specific fields, a/o climate change mitigation in relation to entrepreneurship development, understanding business, SRHR and GBV, agro-industry and industrial production choices' impact on climate change, Implementing Partners should be supported to acquire further training and orientation in their required fields and either recruit additional staff that bring those new skills, or train and upgrade existing staff. Alternatively, they may choose to closely cooperate with specialists and organisations that do have those required skills.	See table merged recommendations	See table merged recommendations
48.	Implementing Partners must learn that critical and constructive feedback to Country Offices or Oxfam Novib is required for the project to be successful and should not be hidden out of fear of not reaching the contractual targets and thereby breaching contractual obligations. Focussing on	EYW partially agrees. This has been openly discussed at the GLE. In EYW Pakistan, partners have always been very open in sharing critical feedback, however there used to be a local steering group where the concerns could be shared	EYW Bangladesh abides by the Oxfam partnership principles and continues to place them in practice. EYW Pakistan will focus on the revival of the local steering group, making ways of working an agenda topic regular monthly calls with partners and on

	meeting numerical production targets, rather than on quality of the activities, undermines the very purpose of the project and may lead to instrumentalising the youth they are supposed to serve, as was occasionally observed.	openly and constructively. It is planned to revive it this year. EYW Indonesia is also focusing on quality over quantity, ensuring feedback mechanism is in place and more space to dialogue every quarter. EYW Bangladesh always encourages partners to share their feedback and to share anything with the CO or higher management. In Ethiopia, monthly update meetings, quarterly joint monitoring, annual performance review workshops are undertaken to collect feedback from partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries. Additional consultative meetings can be held with IPs if needed.	include ways of working as a regular constructive platform during the annual and bi-annual reflections meetings. EYW Indonesia maintains a feedback mechanism every quarter and continues to create more dialogue to open up sensitive discussions. EYW Ethiopia will continue with feedback and accountability mechanisms and ensure regular quality checks. PMU will facilitate this discussion between PMU and COs, and think along with COs on how they can have regular reflections on the mentioned issues.
49.	Oxfam Novib should consider developing a short youth-friendly summary of the MTE, its findings and recommendations in local languages, so that they may see their contributions to the MTE and the project as it moves forward towards the final stage of project implementation.	EYW agrees it is important to share the outcomes of the MTE with youth.	EYW will look into the best ways to share the MTE outcomes with youth of the project (which may not necessarily be in writing).
6. Loan Guarantee Fund			
50.	For effective and efficient access to loans and credit as a component of the EYW, more clarity on the LGF workings and conditions is necessary. The Country Office and Implementing Partners must align their knowledge and expectations, which will also increase clarity for young people.	EYW partially agrees. A consultative meeting has already been undertaken with participation of partner micro finance institutions, implementing partners, local/field stakeholders (BDS providers) and youth group representatives. As all these stakeholders are joint project quarterly monitoring team members, alignment will continue to take place regularly.	Continue with regular monitoring and technical support. A new agreement is set-up to clarify the roles further between the different partners.
51.	Continue to encourage other access to funding. This does not mean a similar fund must be developed in other countries, but that lobby and advocacy activities could support increased and easier access to institutional funding for young people. This will	EYW partially agrees. In the already prepared project EYW Ethiopia influencing strategy, financial inclusion is one of the influencing agenda topics and will be implemented in the coming year of the	Continue with influencing work on youth financial inclusion. Refresher training will be provided to IPs and local/field stakeholders (BDS providers) on BDS to improve business plan and financial linkage

	require the IPs to obtain a greater understanding of business plans, as well as banking and micro-finance systems and arrangements in order to explain their workings to young people organised under EYW and prevent unrealistic expectations and easy defaulting. But IPs must refrain from becoming the formal liaison between the youth and banking institutions or the approval agent for the bank, as such a position will easily undermine the trust young people need to maintain in the IPs.	project. Implementing Partner’s understanding about business plans, market and financial linkage has already been addressed in the provided Business Development Support (BDS) services ToT training. However, based on future identified gaps refresher training will be provided. The role of implementing partners is clearly indicated in the partnership agreement signed with micro finance institutions. IPs are only responsible to support youth groups in business plan preparations, BDS and information provision. All loan provision, management and collection is full responsibility of youth groups and financial institutions.	support skills. A new ToR for the coordination of BDS activities is agreed upon to improve support to youth groups, and the new BDS prototype will be implementing.
Similar recommendations that have been merged		Merged response EYW	Merged proposed action EYW
5. Rather than providing trainings because they are in line with the project’s plans, trainings should focus on young people’s priorities. For example, and in line with young female’s requests, trainings should be facilitated and provided to boys and young men about adequately sharing household and family care tasks: youth themselves, boys and girls shared that there is a need to have special skills training for boys in cooking, caring, etc.		EYW partially agrees. Trainings are tailor made based on the project design which involve co-creating with youth and is based on youth needs. As a programme, EYW needs to be realistic about what can be achieved and has made conscious choices on what can be included. Even a big project as EYW has to balance the wishes in terms of topics, duration, refreshers, etc. in respect of training. The recommendations come up with various additional topics to be included while these initially were not intended to be covered. This also contradicts with earlier mentioned recommendations to increase focus. The current age group has been consciously selected and already widened. We are not planning to further widen the age range. The recommended	EYW will continue to link skills trainings to market demands and youth needs. EYW will also continue training on decent work. In Pakistan, a life skill manual review is planned and a
6. In relation to SRHR and GBV, consider elements of the life skills training to be introduced (by specialised agencies) at earlier ages, such as gender normative behaviour, menstrual hygiene, boys’ wet dreams, etc. as requested by youth themselves that never had such information, and in preparation of their next life stage as young adolescents.			consultation of stakeholders will be done again. The piloting of digitization of life skills training is also planned. EYW Bangladesh will focus on providing skills training on climate resilience and mitigation. The youth led climate smart village piloting is expected to give more insights on skills and employment/self-employment are required for climate mitigation and adaptation. EYW Indonesia will continue to connect with private sector actors
17. In relation to the above and directly related to the ToC, trainings should focus on skills, for which opportunities exist or what the market demands, but where they are inadequately addressed. Market research in and outside of project localities for			

<p>preparation or expansion of existing employment opportunities could contribute to a better understanding of demand. Market research should focus on the link between climate mitigation and employment and could be done in co-operation with scientific institutions for employment and self-employment. Additional soft skill training on labour rights should be provided. Promoting businesses and job opportunities that contradict sustainable development in relation to climate change mitigation should be avoided.</p>	<p>topics are complex and new topics, which would require additional time and capacity, to train field facilitators, conduct context specific assessments etc. This is not feasible considering the timeline of the programme. EYW will continue with ongoing SRHR and GBV training and GALS.</p> <p>Moreover, market needs assessments have already been done and the topics for skills trainings were based on market demands and HCD process. Market researches are available to inform further discussions, but it is not feasible to initiate new market research to inform the selection of topics and module development at this stage of the programme.</p> <p>EYW is already covering training on labour rights in various ways. EYW Bangladesh will keep the discussions about decent work in the manuals, but not in the soft skills module because it would be too heavy for a 3 days discussion. EYW Pakistan has planned interactions of labour department representatives with young people at the Hub. Similar to Bangladesh, the majority of business people are not registered and fall in the informal labour economy that doesn't come under the purview of labour rights. As such, this is more systematically addressed in SME BDS component under the decent work agenda. In Indonesia the soft skills module already includes several sections directly related to working environment and workers' rights. In Ethiopia, labor rights will be addressed in the already planned training on youth</p>	<p>to ensure that all technical skills trained to the youth linked to market needs.</p> <p>Ethiopia will continue with ongoing activities that already cover life skill training, such as Unpaid Care Work(UCW) community conversation and boys and girls school clubs.</p>
<p>31. Subsequent to providing soft skills for the younger youth, mostly still in school, review the available skills' needs for which training is already provided today and start providing additional skills training that meet new market needs and aspirations of youth that have already passed through the soft skills and are at a life stage and motivation level, where they can benefit from innovative/modern techniques in agriculture, animal husbandry, poultry, as well as in housing and drinking water management, solar and other energy sources as well as electronic skills as required. Modern house building skills, including carpentry, plumbing/sanitation, masonry, electric wiring, etc. that are not made available, but in demand for employment opportunities require attention too.</p>		

	empowerment related policies and strategies for relevant government offices and youth groups.	
9. Country Offices and Implementing Partners' staff should review their roles, attitudes and perceptions on prevailing social norms and values and reflect on the way these influence their professional and personal roles played in the EYW project to prevent contradicting the transformative actions towards gender justice principles which the project set out to promote. Learning is an important component of the project.	EYW Partially agrees. Facilitation skills and ways of working with the youth groups and tabling sensitive issues are crucial to the work of EYW and can make or break the success of the programme, so we do agree with the importance of the topic. However the issues flagged are individual, context and partner specific and require attention on that level.	On reviewing the ways of facilitation, EYW will provide indirect support (such as developing toolkits with COs and IPs) and direct support (such as ToTs) through Knowledge Hubs to support field facilitators. EYW will also continue to use peer-to-peer learning to support the capacity building for facilitators and discuss how to monitor change on this.
10. Rather than instructing participants on topics that require reflection, dialogue and deep learning, training activities should encourage generation of knowledge and critical awareness by young people themselves. The focus in these fields should be on facilitating learning by developing young people's critical minds based on project related topics and transformative gender norms and related behaviour.	We want to give the implementing partners the space to work from their own philosophy and approaches and not centrally impose a certain approach at this (late) stage of the programme beyond the approaches already promoted, such as HCD.	EYW Bangladesh will focus on capacity building for project staff through workshops, to increase their facilitation skills to work with youth. EYW Pakistan will carry out an assessment of an existing life skill package especially the facilitation skills training by seeking customer feedback and work on the improvement of overall package from effectiveness perspective. In Pakistan the Paulo Freire approach will also be consulted during the review and revision of life-skill based modules this year.
11. Trainers, willing and able to facilitate such learning culture, daring to challenge dominant traditions should be invited to be part of the project. These trainers should be trained to facilitate learning process. They should remain flexible in their approach to young people and about topics young people want to discuss. The good practice cited, related to Paulo Freire should be considered as it can help understand the difference between teaching and learning. Freire argued that dialogue is necessary for making a difference in the world - it is important as it can be seen to enhance communities and for building social capital. A more practical example that embodies Freire's approach and thinking, are programmes that incorporate MYP. Initially, youth are equipped with basic knowledge on specific topics after which they can become involved as youth leaders, youth influencers, youth as service providers, youth as co-researchers and/or youth as peer educators/facilitators, based on youth's own insights, experiences and critical thinking.	EYW Bangladesh is arranging training for youth peer facilitators and project staff on facilitation skills. The project team already received foundation training, but they might require continuous discussion on these project issues as part of the capacity building. In EYW Pakistan critical thinking and facilitation skills are already imparted as part of ToTs. The mode of training is mainly interactive and action based so it provides numerous opportunities to young people for reflection and dialogue. EYW Indonesia is doing ToT refreshment for trainers every 6 month to maintain the quality of trainers.	EYW Indonesia will continue to ensure all trainers are re-trained through TOT refreshment to make sure that they can facilitate more discussions and deep learning for the youth. In Ethiopia, facilitation skill training has already been provided to community conversation facilitators and will also be provided for Implementing partners. Partner field staff and volunteer community facilitators will be provided with additional refresher trainings. In addition, a life skill training manual will be reviewed jointly

22. In relation to partners and youth participation, in going forward the project should seek to include as much as possible local partners, who already have links to young people in the regions. Partners should be supported, and their skills upgraded so that the bottom-up approach can be strengthened and be even more participatory. In this light, country offices and implementing partners must be vocal about knowledge gaps and training needs, without fear of appearing weak.		with youth representatives and the production of digital videos is planned.
23. In terms of trainings and discussions with young people, implementing partners and trainers should be trained to address and facilitate discussions about sensitive issues, such as cyber bullying as well as topics that young people in their different life stages request. In addition, refresher sessions on life skills should be an added component to the project, as requested by many youths.		
46. To encourage MYP, skills and capacities of several staff members of the Implementing Partners, but also of Country Offices, to work with youth in a truly participatory and empowering way require to be further developed, enhanced, supervised and subsequently mature.		
<p>22. In relation to partners and youth participation, in going forward the project should seek to include as much as possible local partners, who already have links to young people in the regions. Partners should be supported, and their skills upgraded so that the bottom-up approach can be strengthened and be even more participatory. In this light, country offices and implementing partners must be vocal about knowledge gaps and training needs, without fear of appearing weak.</p> <p>47. Based on an inventory of each Implementing Partner's own realisation that they lack adequate and necessary skills and knowledge in specific fields, a/o climate change mitigation in relation to entrepreneurship development, understanding</p>	<p>EYW partially agrees. Adequate skills and knowledge in specific fields are crucial to the programme and technical partners have been hired for this reason. EYW has already planned to train current staff on knowledge gaps. Moreover, EYW acknowledges the importance to develop a joint understanding among these intermingling terms e.g. climate change mitigation in relation to entrepreneurship development and industrial production choice's impact on climate change.</p>	<p>EYW Indonesia will continue with the already planned additional support in climate change and SRHR and learning activities for capacity building, based on self-assessment and peer-assessment of Oxfam and partners vis a vis all components in the project. Through partners' coordination meetings, field visits and training session the project staff in Bangladesh will be oriented on these issues. In addition, modules and information handbook will guide them to conceptualize these issues. EYW Pakistan is suggesting is to develop a joint understanding among EYW team on the indicated</p>

<p>business, SRHR and GBV, agro-industry and industrial production choices' impact on climate change, Implementing Partners should be supported to acquire further training and orientation in their required fields and either recruit additional staff that bring those new skills, or train and upgrade existing staff. Alternatively, they may choose to closely cooperate with specialists and organisations that do have those required skills.</p>		<p>areas with the support of technical leads. This includes reflecting on whether they fall within the purview of EYW project or not and consequently agreeing on joint actions.</p> <p>EYW Ethiopia will provide training to partners, stakeholders and community facilitators on issues of climate change, SRHR, GBV and UCW.</p>
<p>14. As climate change resilience and adaptation in relation to entrepreneurship development is an area in need of additional focus and knowledge, it is recommended to make the availability of that knowledge in the TA Pool a visible focus, thereby attracting the COs and IPs to request for training in these fields. They can bring innovation in the agro-industry as well as other forms of small or larger job creating industrial production in line with sustainable development principles at micro and macro level.</p> <p>24. Questions on climate change and how young people' economic opportunities and gender relations are affected by it should be included in the endline survey. Alternatively, a research or study on this topic could be conducted, which could feed into the project and its activities. Involving youth themselves in such a study may raise or increase their level of interest in climate change issues: 1) how their lives will be affected by climate change 2) how their choice of jobs, businesses, agricultural production methods or lifestyles may help or hinder climate change and its potential mitigation and 3) how they can contribute to mitigation and resilience as part of the larger scheme of changes the project aims for.</p>	<p>EYW agrees climate change resilience and adaptation in relation to entrepreneurship development is an area in need of increased focus and knowledge. EYW also acknowledges the climate change expertise that is already present in the programme and the activities in this area that have already taken place. For example the Climate Smart Village in Bangladesh or the technical training modules in Pakistan that incorporate climate change resilience and adaptation.</p>	<p>Climate change has been and will be one of the key cross cutting topics for the Global Learning Events. PMU has been identifying the needs of country offices to address these issues, among others through peer to peer learning. Climate change experts who can provide support on this topic have been identified in all countries. Moreover, climate change has been integrated in the year four workplans. Currently, a SME measurement tool is developed with a climate friendly check list to assess the climate friendliness of SMEs.</p>

<p>34. Country offices and implementing partners should continue to consider MTE outcomes and learnings not only related to their own countries as referred to in the country chapters in this report, but to other countries as well. Their contexts may differ, but they still share project goals and objectives. Not for a copy/paste intervention approaches, but for understanding and learning.</p> <p>44. The project's plans going forward must allow time to jointly reflect on MTE findings and to build relationships between Country Offices and between Country Offices and Implementing Partners as equals for a common objective and with shared responsibilities, but different roles.</p>	<p>EYW Agrees. Recommendation is completely in line with ongoing implementation. EYW country offices and teams are learning from MTE outcomes and from each other. The GLE provides an important space for this.</p>	<p>This will be prioritized and discussed at the upcoming GLE.</p>
---	---	--

4. Oxfam's factual corrections to the MTE of Empower Youth for Work

Factual error	Corrections
1. In relation to the limited participation of girls in skills trainings, on page 20: "The EYW team in Bangladesh is conscious of this issue, but to date no solution has been offered".	The issue of limited participation of girls in skills trainings has been repeatedly reported in the quarterly reports by the Bangladesh team. Interventions were proposed to address this issue.
2. In relation to the inclusion and exclusion, on page 20: "(the project is) thereby largely excluding illiterate and low literate youth, which would be harder to reach, organise and support".	The only component of the project that focuses on literate youth is the startup competition. Otherwise the jobs, microbusiness and farming packages are solely dedicated for illiterate youth. The HCD partner has however proposed to run a job package with young people up to a qualification of 12 grades. Nonetheless, a separate stream is developed for uneducated youth to get employment. The microbusiness and farming packages are completely running with illiterate youth.
3. In relation to the planning of activities for the youth hubs, on page 37: "Rather than planning activities in a top-down format, allow for youth-driven activities based on what they want and need at that specific point in time."	All youth hubs are designed through the HCD method. Consequently, they are youth driven as from the initial stage youth groups defined what types of hubs they want to build. Hubs are therefore not top-down. They are also already being used as a space for young people to meet, learn, share and strategize together for youth leaders. For instance, in Pakistan both the Hubs have cafeteria facilities. Youth leaders replicate

	them and use space of their home as mini hubs to come together and do social activities.
4. In relation to continuing and further develop activities, on page 40: “In turn, interventions must reflect the concrete gender differentiated experiences and views of the young people themselves and be based on feedback from country offices and implementing partners. This way, the project’s interventions will continue to be based on decisions about the objectives and goals the project wants to reach and considerations around whether chosen methods are adequate to help the project reach set key objectives.”	This recommendation is incorrect, as interventions are proposed and designed at country office and implementing partner level and are thus not based on feedback from them.
5. In relation to sustainable development and climate change mitigation in Ethiopia, on page 64: “The two modules reviewed (poultry and fruits & vegetables), regrettably, neither discuss gender aspects of the undertakings, nor do they discuss opportunities for sustainable development as a contribution towards climate-change mitigation or climate change resilient techniques”.	Measures have been taken to make the modules gender sensitive and climate friendly. Among the many activities done, some of training topics are selected due to high interest of women in topics such as poultry production, beauty salon, food processing, bakery etc. Gender is also one module and a topic evaluation criteria. This can easily be found in the evaluation sections in each module. Gender integration training has also been provided to module developers while preparing the modules. Regarding climate change integration, many activities have already been done, though there are more interventions required to integrate climate change as expected. Climate change is considered in the training topic selection. Most of the training topics are agriculture related, like fruit and vegetable production. Climate change and environmental pollution is one of evaluation criteria of each training topic in the modules. Climate change integration training has already been given to selected TVET TTLM ToT training attendants.
6. In relation to the poultry and fruits & vegetables modules in Ethiopia, on page 64: “The training modules seen promote industrial scale, environmental unfriendly agricultural practices and techniques, which do not support gender equality; which are based on high usage of chemical fertilisers, pesticides and industrial production techniques and industrially produced chicken feed that counter the EYW project’s objectives”.	The EYW Ethiopia team acknowledged that out of the already developed TTLM modules, Fruit and vegetable production module is the only one that may promote the use of chemicals/inorganic fertilizers. However, there are also organic practices suggested to be employed in the same module already. The Mid-term Evaluation did not provide a complete picture as such.
7. In relation to the organizational structure in Indonesia, on page 78: “Yet the country’s patriarchal culture remains easily the default culture, also in the IP structure”.	In terms of organizational structure, the structure for EYW project in Indonesia has been mostly covered by women. All PMs are women and in the field there are young women involved as part of the officers/associate.

8. In relation to the role and function of the Indonesian governmental organization Karang Taruna (KT), on page 82: “Though we noted that there are different views about KT, also related to the specific location, the overall principle difference to be addressed or remain conscious of between KT and the EYW project, is the fact that KT as institution is not intended to contribute to social change or gender justice”.	The EYW Indonesian team states Karang Taruna is different from the other governmental organizations. In South Sulawesi and West Java, Karang Taruna is formed to contribute genuinely to social empowerment of the community.
9. In relation to the finance in Indonesia, on page 83: “Reportedly, it requires at least two months for Oxfam to process finance request from IPs. This situation led to an IP reportedly using its organisation’s savings up to 40.000 Euro to implement the project. This needs to be prevented”.	This is not a fact as no organization covers 40,000 EURO.
10. On page 83: “There is hardly any visible promotion by Oxfam Indonesia yet of the attention required for climate change mitigation in relation to job creation as part of the EYW approach”.	EYW Indonesia states that concerns about climate change were already raised from initial stage of the project. In Year 2 even, additional support from other specialized organisations in climate change was received and the climate change module was designed to include sample of green entrepreneurship. Yet, there was no space to implement this due to the MoU issues.
11. In relation to the technical trainings in Pakistan, on page 90: “A few start-ups have been initiated; two in Layyah and three in Jamshoro, as reported by Implementing Partners, while the target is 30”.	The numbers mentioned are actually the number of winners for start up. The total start-Up trained so far are 15 at both locations.
12. On page 93: “The global EYW project is based on generic assumptions, including young people’s abilities and knowledge levels. For example, the literacy rate in Layyah is 52.98% for males and 23.39% for females over the age of 10, while in Jamshoro the literacy rate is 59% for males and 28% for females over the age of 10 in rural areas. Because these assumptions of capabilities, willingness and knowledge have not been tested in the Pakistan context, they provide a weak and generic foundation for the project”.	Pakistan team recognized the literacy rate mentioned, but the team also saw that both literate and illiterate youth face the same situation of lacking job and business opportunities. These factors have been considered while designing project activities in Pakistan, that is why sets of different service packages were created that cater young people with different educational background. Farming package is designed for completely uneducated people and agri-business target (self-employment) is equal to job targets. Micro-business package is for primary educated, while job package is for FA/or technical education.
13. On page 97: Participatory Gender Reviews to aggregate changes, deepen gender analysis and plan change at scale. The GALS method could support this.”	In fact, Participatory Gender Review is part of GALS.
14. In relation to the beneficiary numbers, on page 103: - The age range quoted total number of beneficiaries (18+).	The age range of the total beneficiaries is 15-29.

<p>- In relation to the total number of direct beneficiaries reached, as stated in the second annual report: “The female to male ratio is slightly lower than 1:1, which suggests that the project’s goal of reaching 70:30, or roughly 2:1, female to male participation has not been reached thus far.”</p>	<p>The total numbers of direct beneficiaries as stated in the second annual report is 42% male and 58% female. Thus, the mentioned female to male ratio is also incorrect.</p>
<p>15. In relation to survey questions in the midline, on page 105: “Some more significant changes from the baseline to the midline includes a change in the question about the perceived level of threat of domestic violence. This question was changed from asking what other people thought, to focus on what the respondent thought about violence against women. Such a change is significant as it moves away from measuring expectations, which underline social norms, to measuring personal beliefs. In other words, it moves away from measurements in aid of the overall project objective of changing social norms. Ideally, both questions should remain.”</p>	<p>This is indeed changed, as the KPI on GBV focusses on personal beliefs and personal actions: % of young women in the programme who feel their daily lives are limited by the threat of gender-based violence % of young women and men with improved skills to act as change agent to eliminate gender-based violence Hence, we changed the measurement to be aligned to the KPI after checking with the country teams on which measurement fits best with their intervention strategies. The KPI on GBV does not refer to social norms and the midline survey includes various other questions on social norms. It is thus not the case that it moves away from measurements in aid of the overall project objective of changing social norms.</p>

Annex 1: The context and background of the Mid-Term Evaluation

The five-year Empower Youth for Work (EYW) project aims to improve the economic and overall opportunities for young women and men in rural climate-affected areas of Bangladesh, Pakistan, Indonesia and Ethiopia. The 5-year project started in June 2016 and is funded by IKEA Foundation with a total grant size of 20.9 million Euro.

During the Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE), EYW was in its third year of implementation. The main aim of the MTE was to systematically analyze EYW's progress and achievements up to November 2018. The findings are to inform the further implementation of the project, allowing us to fine-tune and – where needed – redirect current strategies to maximally achieve our aspired impact. More broadly, it will inform Oxfam's and IKEA Foundation's current and future work related to youth, employment and entrepreneurship.

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation was threefold:

- a) Collect evidence about whether the project has been implemented as planned and the expected as well as unexpected outcomes achieved so far
- b) Assess the effectiveness, relevance, efficiency, sustainability, partnerships of our current strategies in each country, from the point of view of different stakeholders, in particular young women and men. For Ethiopia, a specific question on the Loan Guarantee Fund was included.
- c) Critically review emerging evidence related to the achievement of EYW's overall impact (project documents, mid-line survey results, ..) and collect further qualitative evidence to substantiate these findings.

The Programme-wide questions were:

- a) What are the principal outcomes/contributions for the programme as a whole? What trends emerge across countries? Are changes so far in line with the logic underlying the Theory of Change, ultimately realizing our final impact?
- b) Does the global/multi-country layer of the programme fulfil its roles in terms of oversight and management as well as on influencing, MEAL and innovation? Does the Pool of Technical Advisors work well?
- c) Which good practices exist and could be shared between countries?

The specific objectives of the Mid-Term Evaluation included:

- a) Stimulate learning and reflection among country offices, partners and youth groups, including from what has or hasn't worked so far, and serve as input for a dialogue on opportunities to strategically redirect our work in the coming years.
- b) Evaluate and validate the achievements reached under each outcome as presented in the EYW annual reports (and underlying documents like quarterly monitoring reports)
- c) Validate the Theory of Change of this project and its underlying assumptions.
- d) Develop concrete recommendations for the next years of programme implementation as well as the development of future projects on related topics and for multi-country programmes in general. Important aspects for consideration throughout the Mid-Term Evaluation included gender, climate and innovation.